

Mixed tenure development: a new orthodoxy

- Early instance: Dublin Docklands Development Authority
- Planning & Development Act 2000
- *Re-Building Ireland 2016*: 'Mixed tenure development on State lands' (p. 50)
- Mixed tenure as proxy for mixed income, mixed social class
- Leads to sustainable, inclusive, integrated neighbourhoods? Better for low-income households (social integration, good local services, employment, etc.)
- Rejects traditional large-scale single-tenure social housing:
 - Stigma, ghettoisation, concentration of poverty, social exclusion

Doubts:

- Unclear what mixed tenure means (pepper-potted, segmented, segregated)
- Research evidence for positive social effects is weak/mixed (e.g. E. Sautkina, L. Bond & A. Kearns (2012) 'Mixed Evidence on Mixed Tenure Effects: Findings from a Systematic Review of UK Studies, 1995–2009' *Housing Studies*, 27:6, 748-782)

Carnegie, M. Norris, M. Byrne (2018) 'Tenure mixing to combat public housing stigmatization: External benefits, internal challenges and contextual influences in three Dublin neighborhoods' *Cities* 89 (Sept)

- Can be difficult to sustain (e.g. Ballymun regeneration)
- Can produce internal social divisions ('internal stigmatization')
- Diverts attention from more important ingredients of successful neighbourhoods (e.g. good housing, facilities, social services)
- Reduces output of social housing
 - Public land diverted to private sector
 - Increases costs, reduces economies of scale: legal, planning, procurement, construction, management

Yet ...

- Tallaght West has evolved into a stable, vibrant, expanding and upwardly mobile urban community
- 16,700 population in 1991 → 30,000 in 2016
- Tenure mix: 50% owner occupation by 2002
- Social mix:
 - Managers/professionals: 6% in 1991, 20% in 2016
 - Higher education: 3% in 1991, 21% in 2016
 - Primary education: 40% in 1991, 17% in 2016
- Resident satisfaction: majority (esp. among young people) regard it as a good place to live & a good place to rear children
- High demand housing: shown by vacancy rates, house prices, rents, social housing waiting lists
- An ordinary, settled working class/lower middle class city district: socially sustainable urban development in action

The case for the old model:

- Rapid, large-scale, economical housing provision, 1930s-1980s:
 - Reasonable quality, affordable rents, secure tenure
- Large single-tenure local authority estates evolved into stable, socially integrated neighbourhoods, tied into the settled urban fabric (Crumlin, Cabra, Ballyfermot ...)
- The case of Tallaght West (Jobstown, Fettercairn, Killinarden & Brookfield) (*based on forthcoming TW-CDI report on development of Tallaght West since 1970s*)
 - 1979-1985: 4,300 new dwellings, 98% local authority (bigger than Mullingar & Tullamore combined)
 - Uninspired neighbourhood lay-outs, little-used open spaces
 - Poor local social services in early years, weak estate management
 - Hit by economic crisis of late 1980s: 50% unemployment rate in 1991
 - Problems with anti-social behaviour in 1980s & 1990s
 - Lone parents with dependent children half of all households by early 2000s

Lessons for housing policy

- Do not repeat mistakes of the past ...
- .. But DO repeat successes: large-scale social housing provision
- Local authorities: did the job in the past
- Can do it again now, only better
- Scale & quality are essential
- Tenure mixing is not: may have some benefits but impedes